

STATE OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN Attorney General JOSHUA PEPPER Records Access Officer Assistant Attorney General

March 12, 2013

via e-mail: elena@judgewatch.orgMs. Elena SassowerCenter for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA)P.O. Box 8101White Plains, NY 10602

## RE: Freedom of Information Law (FOIL) Request # 120532

Dear Ms. Sassower:

This letter responds to your correspondence dated March 5, 2013, which, pursuant to FOIL, requested the following:

"[R]e: Records - Emily Pines, et al. v. State of New York, Nassau Co: #10-13518; Appellate Division, 2nd Dept. #2011-2821

Missing from the compact disk (CD) you sent us pertaining to the record of Pines v. State of New York, requested by our August 23, 2012 letter pursuant to FOIL & the Attorney General's Project Sunlight Initiative of his Public Integrity Unit, are the four memoranda of law that Nassau Supreme Court Justice Karen Murphy recites in the Judgment she signed on March 10, 2011.

These are:

- (1) defendant's memorandum of law accompanying its August 23, 2010 dismissal motion;
- (2) plaintiffs' memorandum of law accompanying their September 27, 2010 cross-motion;
- (3) defendant's memorandum of law accompanying its October 12, 2010 reply affirmation;
- (4) plaintiffs' November 23, 2010 memorandum of law in reply and in further support of their cross-motion for summary judgment.

Ms. Elena Sassower March 12, 2013 Page 2

> For your convenience, the Judgment is enclosed. Kindly confirm that you will promptly furnish the four memorandum of law to us, as well as any transcript of oral argument on February 4, 2011 when - according to the Judgment - the parties 'appeared' before Justice Murphy and were 'heard' on defendant's converted summary judgment motion."

Attached to this e-mail are documents numbered 120532-373 through 120532-444 that respond to your request.

This FOIL request is closed.

Sincerely,

Joshua Pepper

Joshua Pepper Assistant Attorney General

Attachment