

**TABLE OF CONTENTS – RECORD ON APPEAL**

**Volume 1: pp. 1 – 535a**

Plaintiffs’ Statement Pursuant to CPLR §5531 ..... xxii

Plaintiffs’ January 10, 2018 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement  
and accompanying “legal autopsy”/analysis  
of Judge Denise Hartman’s November 28, 2017 Decision and Judgment ..... 1

**Judge Hartman’s November 28, 2017 Decision and Judgment..... 31**

Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement ..... 42

**Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order ..... 49**

**Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order..... 52**

Plaintiffs’ August 5, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement ..... 61

**Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order..... 68**

\* \* \*

**Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Order to Show Cause, with Stay & TRO,  
as signed by Judge Roger McDonough ..... 80**

Plaintiff Sassower’s September 2, 2016 Moving Affidavit ..... 83

**Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Summons & Verified Complaint..... 85**

The September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint [at R.99, fn. 1] incorporates by reference the record of plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo, et al.* (Albany Co. #1788-2014), and annexes its three verified pleadings as Exhibits A, B, and C, the three decisions of Judge McDonough thereon as Exhibits D, E, and F, and plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy/analysis” of those three decisions as Exhibit G, as follows:

<b>Exhibit A:</b>	<b>March 23, 2016 Verified Second Supplemental Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, <i>CJA v. Cuomo, et al.</i> (Albany Co. #1788-2014)</b> .....	135
<b>Exhibit B:</b>	<b>March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, <i>CJA v. Cuomo, et al.</i> (Albany Co. #1788-2014)</b> .....	226
<b>Exhibit C:</b>	<b>March 31, 2015 Verified Supplemental Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, <i>CJA v. Cuomo, et al.</i> (Albany Co. #1788-2014)</b> .....	273
<b>Exhibit D:</b>	<b>Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order</b> .....	315
<b>Exhibit E:</b>	<b>Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order</b> .....	326
<b>Exhibit F:</b>	<b>Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order</b> .....	335
<b>Exhibit G:</b>	<b>Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Justice McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision (&amp; prior decisions)</b> .....	338
<b>Exhibit H:</b>	<b>Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d; pp. 1-2, 72-73, 94, 96-97, 100, 124-125</b> .....	374
<b>Exhibit I-1:</b>	<b>Plaintiffs’ July 13, 2016 FOIL request to Comptroller’s records access officer: “State Aid to the Counties for District Attorney Salaries for Calendar Years 2010-2016”</b> .....	384
<b>Exhibit I-2:</b>	<b>July 20, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer</b> .....	386
<b>Exhibit I-3:</b>	<b>July 22, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer</b> .....	387
<b>Exhibit J-1:</b>	<b>Plaintiffs’ July 11, 2016 FOIL request to Criminal Justice Services and Division of the Budget records access officers: ‘The ‘plan’ to reimburse counties not covered by Judiciary Law §183-a for district attorney salaries: fiscal years 2016-17, 2015-16, and 2014-15’</b> .....	388
<b>Exhibit J-2:</b>	<b>July 15, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services records access officer</b> .....	389
<b>Exhibit J-3:</b>	<b>August 12, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services records access officer</b> .....	390
<b>Exhibit J-4:</b>	<b>July 25, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer</b> .....	391

Exhibit K: Plaintiffs’ September 1, 2016 FOIL request: “Director of the Budget’s certificate of approval of the Division of Criminal Justice Services’ budget for fiscal year 2016-2017, contained in Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d – & any certification by the Division of Criminal Justice Services of its own budget” .....	392
--	-----

**Transcript of September 2, 2016 Oral Argument before Judge McDonough.....**392a, 444

**Plaintiffs’ September 7, 2016 Notice to New York State’s 62 Counties & their Institutional/Lobbying Entities of their Right to Seek Intervention, Pursuant to CPLR §1012 and §1013 .....** 393

Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service and transmitting e-mails.....	397
– to 62 counties & their institutional/lobbying entities.....	398
– to AAG Kerwin – “I take this opportunity to reiterate plaintiffs’ request that the Attorney General intervene on plaintiffs’ behalf or undertake our representation...Please promptly advise who is <u>independently</u> evaluating our entitlement thereto pursuant to State Finance Law Article 7-A and Executive Law §63.1”.....	400

**Defendants’ September 15, 2016 Opposition and Cross-Motion.....** 403

AAG Kerwin’s September 15, 2016 Notice of Cross-Motion.....	403
---	-----

AAG Kerwin’s September 15, 2016 Affirmation.....	405
--	-----

Exhibit A: Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Summons & Verified Complaint .....	410a, 85
---	----------

Exhibit B: Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Order to Show Cause & Moving Affidavit .....	410a, 80
---	----------

AAG Kerwin’s September 15, 2016 Memorandum of Law in Opposition & in Support of Cross-Motion .....	411
--	-----

Appendix – September 1, 2016 Decision/Supreme Court-Nassau Co – <i>Coll v. NYS Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation</i> (Nassau Co. Supreme Court #2598-2016).....	428
--	-----

<b><u>Plaintiffs’ September 30, 2016 Reply and Opposition</u></b> .....	429
Plaintiff Sassower’s September 30, 2016 Affidavit in Reply & Opposition .....	429
Exhibit L: Plaintiffs’ September 23, 2016 FOIL/records request to Governor Cuomo’s records access officer & to the Secretary of the Senate – “Nomination & Confirmation of Denise Hartman to the New York Court of Appeals” .....	440
Exhibit M-1: Plaintiffs’ September 8, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	440a, 400
Exhibit M-2: Plaintiffs’ September 16, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	441
Exhibit N: Plaintiffs’ September 28, 2016 FOIL request to Attorney General Schneiderman’s records access officer – “Assistant Attorney General Kerwin & Guidelines, Policies & Procedures” .....	442
Exhibit O: Transcript of September 2, 2016 oral argument before Judge McDonough.....	444
Exhibit P: April 5, 2016 complaint in <i>James Coll v. NYS Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation, NYS Legislature, NYS Governor (Supreme Court/Nassau Co.)</i> .....	459
Exhibit Q-1: September 9, 2016 e-mail from Secretary of the Senate .....	463
Exhibit Q-2: September 9, 2016 letter from Assembly records access officer .....	464
Exhibit Q-3: September 9, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer .....	465
Exhibit Q-4: September 12, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer .....	466
Exhibit R: Plaintiffs’ September 7, 2016 e-mail to NYS’ 62 counties and their institutional/lobbying entities .....	466a, 398
Plaintiffs’ enclosed September 7, 2016 Notice of Right to Seek Intervention .....	466a, 393
Exhibit S: September 8, 2016 Affidavit of Service for plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint, Order to Show Cause, & Moving Affidavit.....	467
<b>Plaintiffs’ September 30, 2016 Memorandum of Law in Reply &amp; in Opposition to Defendants’ Cross-Motion</b> .....	471

**Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order**..... 527

**Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin** .....535a, 548

**Volume 2: pp. 536-996**

**Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause,  
as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017** ..... 536

Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit..... 538

Exhibit T-1: Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order..... 544, 527

Exhibit T-2: AAG Kerwin’s February 3, 2017 Notice of Entry ..... 545

Exhibit T-3: Plaintiff Sassower’s January 17, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin ..... 546

Exhibit T-4: Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer to plaintiffs’ Verified  
Complaint, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin ..... 548

**Exhibit U: Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis  
of Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order** ..... 554

Exhibit V: Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin ..... 578

Exhibit W: Plaintiffs’ September 23, 2016 FOIL/records request to Secretary  
of Senate & Governor’s records access officer –  
“RE: Nomination & Confirmation of Denise Hartman to the New  
York Court of Claims” ..... 579

Exhibit W-1: September 30, 2016 e-mail response from Secretary of the Senate ..... 580

Exhibit W-2: September 30, 2016 acknowledgment from Governor’s records  
access officer ..... 582

Exhibit W-3: October 31, 2016 response from Governor’s records access officer ..... 583

Exhibit X: Plaintiffs’ September 28, 2016 FOIL request to Attorney General’s  
records access officer – “RE: Assistant Attorney General Adrienne  
Kerwin & Guidelines, Policies & Procedures” ..... 590

Exhibit X-1: October 5, 2016 acknowledgment from Attorney General’s records access officer.....	592
Exhibit X-2: November 3, 2016 response from Attorney General’s records access officer.....	593
Exhibit X-3: Plaintiffs’ December 1, 2016 appeal to Attorney General’s FOIL appeals officer.....	599
Exhibit X-4: December 15, 2016 determination of Attorney General’s FOIL appeals officer.....	602
Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mails .....	610
“As Attorney General Schneiderman bears foremost responsibility for the conduct of his office and for upholding the rule of law and Constitution in this state, please furnish this e-mail to him, as well, with my request that he also call me.” .....	612
<b><u>Defendants’ March 22, 2017 Opposition to Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u></b> .....	613
AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition.....	613
Exhibit A: Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits) .....	615a, 87
Exhibit B: Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	615a, 527
Exhibit C: Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin .....	615a, 548
AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition.....	616
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 Letter to Judge Hartman “...&amp; Notice to the Attorney General”</u></b> .....	634a, 838
With 4 enclosures:	
(1) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	634a, 647
(2) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	634a, 663

(3) Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	634a, 655
(4) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	634a, 667
<b><u>Judge Hartman’s March 24, 2017 So-Ordered Letter</u></b> .....	634a, 840
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, with Preliminary Injunction &amp; TRO, as signed by Judge Hartman</u></b> .....	635
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s March 29, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u> .....	639
Exhibit 1-A: Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	647
Exhibit 1-B: Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	651
Exhibit 2-A: Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	655
Exhibit 2-B: Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	659
Exhibit 3-A: Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	663
Exhibit 3-B: Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	667
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Verified Supplemental Complaint</u></b> .....	671

**Transcript of March 29, 2017 Oral Argument before Judge Hartman.....746a, 816**

**Plaintiffs’ Free-Standing Evidence**, which plaintiff Sassower brought to the courthouse on March 29, 2017 [R.823-829, R.835] to establish plaintiffs’ *prima facie* entitlement to the granting of the second, third, fourth, fifth, and sixth branches of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause [R.636-637] – and then filed in the Clerk’s Office with the signed, original Order to Show Cause [R.635-638], immediately following the oral argument<sup>1</sup>:

1. Defendant Governor Cuomo’s original budget bills
2. Defendant Governor Cuomo’s 30-day amended budget bills
3. Defendant Senate’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017
4. Defendant Assembly’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017
5. Defendant Senate’s “one-house budget resolution”
6. Defendant Assembly’s “one-house budget resolution”

**Defendants’ April 21, 2017 Opposition**

**to Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause..... 747**

AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition ..... 747

- Exhibit 1: Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits) .....752a, 87
- Exhibit 2: Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....752a, 527
- Exhibit 3: Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....752a,536
- Exhibit 4: Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on March 29, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....752a, 635
- Exhibit 5: Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Verified Supplemental Complaint (superseding/corrected).....752a, 671

---

<sup>1</sup> Recounted and itemized by plaintiff Sassower’s March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman, annexed as Exhibit 7-a [R.861] to her May 15, 2017 reply affidavit, in substantiation of its ¶8 [R.791] itemizing the free-standing evidence that plaintiff Sassower had brought to the courthouse. *See, also*, AAG Lynch’s acknowledgment at ¶15 of her April 21, 2017 opposing affirmation [R.751].



Exhibit 6:	print-out/summary of Assembly actions on budget bill #A.3000D .....	753
Exhibit 7:	page 450 of budget bill #A.3000D .....	754
Exhibit 8:	print-out of budget bill #S.2003D .....	755
Exhibit 9:	purported “cover page of the Judiciary budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, with the certification of the Chief Judge of the Court of Appeals, and approval of the then-current members of the Court of Appeals” .....	761
Exhibit 10:	purported “cover letter, signed by John J. Flanagan and Carl E. Heastie, certifying the Legislature’s budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, submitted to the Governor on December 1, 2016” .....	765
	AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition .....	766
	<b><u>Judge Hartman’s April 25, 2017 So-Ordered Letter</u></b> .....	787
	<b><u>Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 Letter to Judge Hartman, “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General”</u></b> .....	787a, 810
	<b><u>Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 So-Ordered Letter</u></b> .....	787a, 815
	<b><u>Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order</u></b> .....	49
	<b><u>Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order</u></b> .....	52
	<b><u>Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply in Further Support of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u></b> .....	788
	Plaintiff Sassower’s May 15, 2017 Reply Affidavit .....	788
	Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mail – “Plaintiffs have no objection to your belatedly withdrawing your opposition papers and taking such other remedial steps, as is your duty to do” .....	808
Exhibit 4-a:	Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General” .....	810
Exhibit 4-b:	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 So-Ordered Letter .....	815

Exhibit 5:	Transcript of March 29, 2017 oral argument before Judge Hartman .....	816
Exhibit 6-a:	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...& Notice to Attorney General” .....	838
Exhibit 6-b:	Judge Hartman’s So-Ordered March 24, 2017 Letter.....	840
Exhibit 6-c:	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	841
Exhibit 6-d:	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “...& notice to Attorney General” .....	842
Exhibit 6-e:	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	843
Exhibit 6-f:	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns...” .....	844
Exhibit 6-g:	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	845
Exhibit 6-h:	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you” .....	846
Exhibit 6-i:	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review” .....	847
Exhibit 6-j:	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail.....	848
Exhibit 6-k:	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?” .....	849
Exhibit 6-l:	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail .....	850
Exhibit 6-m:	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”.....	851
Exhibit 6-n:	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman .....	852
Exhibit 6-o:	Judge Hartman’s March 28, 2017 letter.....	857
Exhibit 6-p:	AG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”.....	858

Exhibit 6-q:	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN” .....	859
Exhibit 6-r:	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office”. .....	860
Exhibit 7-a:	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction” .....	861
Exhibit 7-b:	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law” .....	863
Exhibit 7-c:	AAG Lynch’s March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman, retracting characterization of “amended” budget bills as “internal documents” .....	865
Exhibit 7-d:	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman” .....	868
Exhibit 7-e:	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED” .....	870
Exhibit 7-f:	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter .....	872
Exhibit 7-g:	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.” .....	773
Exhibit 7-h:	Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “... Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10” .....	875
Exhibit 8-a:	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	876a, 647

Exhibit 8-b:	March 31, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	877
Exhibit 8-c:	Plaintiffs' April 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: "Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response..." .....	878
Exhibit 8-d:	Plaintiffs' April 28, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: "Clarifying the Senate's response..." .....	879
Exhibit 8-e:	May 5, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	882
Exhibit 9-a:	Plaintiffs' March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: "March 12, 2016 'amending' of Governor Cuomo's budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017" .....	882a, 663
Exhibit 9-b:	March 31, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	883
Exhibit 9-c:	Plaintiffs' May 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: "Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response..." .....	884
Exhibit 9-d:	May 11, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	885
Exhibit 10-a:	Plaintiffs' March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: "March 20, 2017 'amending' of Governor Cuomo's Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018" .....	885a, 651
Exhibit 10-b:	April 3, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate .....	886
Exhibit 10-c:	Plaintiffs' May 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: "Clarifying your April 3, 2017 response..." .....	887
Exhibit 11-a:	Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: "March 13, 2017 'amending' of Governor Cuomo's budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018" .....	887a, 655
Exhibit 11-b:	March 30, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	888
Exhibit 11-c:	Plaintiffs' May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: "Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response..." .....	889
Exhibit 11-d:	May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	890
Exhibit 12-a:	Plaintiffs' March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: "March 11, 2016 'amending' of Governor Cuomo's budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017" .....	890a, 667

Exhibit 12-b: March 30, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	891
Exhibit 12-c: Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...” .....	892
Exhibit 12-d: May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	893
Exhibit 13-a: Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	893a, 659
Exhibit 13-b: April 3, 2017 acknowledgment from Assembly records access officer.....	894
Exhibit 13-c: Assembly’s April 13, 2017 response .....	895
Exhibit 13-d: Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your April 13, 2017 response...” .....	896
Exhibit 13-e: May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	897
Exhibit 14-a: State Operations Budget Bill #S.2000-D/A.3000-D (p. 1).....	898
Exhibit 14-b: Excerpts – State Operations Bill #S.2000/A.3000 (original).....	899
Exhibit 15-a: Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003-D/A.3003-D (p. 1).....	909
Exhibit 15-b: Excerpts – Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003/A.3003 (original).....	910
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Reply and in Further Support of March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u></b> .....	922
Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mail – “Plaintiffs have no objection to your belatedly withdrawing your opposition papers and taking such other remedial steps, as is your duty to do” .....	989
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ May 19, 2017 letter, enclosing subpoenas <i>duces tecum</i> in reply &amp; in further support of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u></b> .....	991
Plaintiffs’ Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i> to Secretary of the Senate .....	992
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	993a, 647

Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	993a, 651
Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	993a, 663
Plaintiffs’ Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i> to Assembly records access officer .....	994
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	995a, 655
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018” .....	995a, 659
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017” .....	995a, 667
<b><u>AAG Kerwin’s May 23, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman</u></b> .....	996

**Volume 3: pp. 997 - 1386**

<b><u>Plaintiffs’ June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on June 16, 2017</u></b> .....	997
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s June 12, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u> .....	999
<b>plaintiffs’ analysis of Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 decision at ¶¶5-8, 10-11</b> .....	R.1002-1007
Exhibit A-1: AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry .....	1011
Exhibit A-2: Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1011a, 49
Exhibit B-1: AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry .....	1012
Exhibit B-2: Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order .....	1012a, 52

Exhibit C:	Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement .....	1012b, 42
Exhibit D:	Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.....	1013
<b>Exhibit E:</b>	<b>Plaintiffs’ analysis of AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 opposition to plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause.....</b>	<b>1014</b>
Exhibit F:	Plaintiff’ April 10, 2017 complaint to Third Judicial District Administrative Judge Breslin: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED: willful, deliberate, and purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman” .....	1039
Exhibit G:	Plaintiffs’ April 21, 2017 complaint to Deputy Chief Administrative Judge Michael Coccoma: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED – Misconduct Complaint against Third Judicial District Administrative Judge Thomas A. Breslin & his highest-ranking administrative staff...for aiding and abetting the willful, deliberate, and purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman...” .....	1052
	Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service for signed June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause, with transmitting e-mail “...NOTICE TO SUPERVISORY/MANAGERIAL LEVELS, INCLUDING DEFENDANT AG SCHNEIDERMAN” .....	1067
	<b><u>Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order</u></b> .....	<b>68</b>
	<b><u>Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Opposition to Plaintiffs’ June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause and Cross-Motion</u></b> .....	<b>1069</b>
	AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Notice of Cross-Motion .....	1069
	AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition & in Support of Cross-Motion .....	1071
Exhibit A:	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits) .....	1078a, 87
Exhibit B:	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	1078a, 527

Exhibit C:	Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed & verified by AAG Kerwin.....	1078a, 548
Exhibit D:	Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman .....	1078a, 536
	Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....	1078a, 538
	Plaintiffs’ Exhibit U analysis of December 21, 2016 Decision ...	1078a, 554
Exhibit E:	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1078a, 49
	transmitting May 5, 2017 letter.....	1078a, 1079
Exhibit F:	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order .....	1078a, 52
Exhibit G:	Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman .....	1078a, 635
	Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply Memorandum of Law.....	1078a, 922
Exhibit H:	Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1078a, 68
Exhibit I:	Chapter 60, Part E, of the Laws of 2015 – Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation .....	1080
Exhibit J:	December 24, 2015 Report of the Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation .....	1083
Exhibit K:	March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action (w/o exhibits).....	1105a, 226
	Table of Exhibits to plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint and back .....	1105a, 1106
Exhibit L:	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Order to Show Cause for a Stay with TRO in prior citizen-taxpayer action, as signed by Supreme Court Justice Michael Lynch .....	1113
Exhibit M:	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 letter to Justice Lynch.....	1115
	Justice Lynch’s April 1, 2014 So-Ordered Letter.....	1118
	Justice Lynch’ March 31, 2014 So-Ordered Letter .....	1119



Exhibit N:	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion .....	1120
	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Supporting Memorandum of Law .....	1123
Exhibit O:	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision .....	1160a, 326
Exhibit P:	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 Notice of Motion .....	1161
	Plaintiff Sassower’s March 31, 2015 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits) .....	1163
Exhibit Q:	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision.....	1170a, 335
Exhibit R:	Plaintiffs’ September 22, 2015 Notice of Cross-Motion .....	1171
	Plaintiff Sassower’s September 22, 2015 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits) .....	1174
Exhibit S:	Plaintiffs’ March 23, 2016 Emergency Order to Show Cause with Stay & TRO, as signed by Judge McDonough.....	1182
	Plaintiff Sassower’s March 23, 2016 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits) .....	1185
Exhibit T:	Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision.....	1188a, 315
Exhibit U:	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision .....	1188a, 338
Exhibit V:	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail: “...What Disciplinary Action will be taken by Justice Lynch vs the Attorney General Consistent with §100.3D(2) of the Chief Administrator’s Rules Governing Judicial Conduct?” .....	1189
	Plaintiffs’ May 8, 2014 e-mail, with transmitted May 8, 2014 letter to Judge McDonough .....	1191
Exhibit W:	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1193
	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin, cc: AAG James McGowen.....	1194
	AAG McGowan’s May 2, 2014 e-mail.....	1195

	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin – “Please forward to Deputy Attorney General Meg Levine – The Duty of Supervisory Oversight & Independent Evaluation Consistent with Executive Law 63.1 & State Finance Law Article 7A...” .....	1196
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to Comptroller DiNapoli’s Investigations Unit – “Reporting Government Fraud – Grand Larceny of the Public Fisc & Taxpayer Monies: Governor Cuomo’s Budget Bill of Legislative & Judiciary Appropriations for Fiscal Year 2014-2015” .....	1199
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin – “Please forward to Deputy Attorney General Meg Levine...”, with enclosed October 9, 2013 e-mail to scholars .....	1201
	Plaintiffs’ May 17, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan, cc: to Comptroller’s office .....	1203
	Plaintiffs’ May 21, 2014 e-mail to Attorney General Schneiderman’s Intergovernmental Affairs Bureau Director, with its enclosed May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion .....	1204
	Plaintiffs’ June 6, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan.....	1210
	Plaintiffs’ March 26, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1211
	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1212
	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1213
	Plaintiffs’ March 11, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1214
Exhibit X:	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office” .....	1215a, 860
	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman .....	1215a, 852
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction” .....	1215a, 861

	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter .....	1215a, 872
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman .....	1215a, 838
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction” .....	1215a, 861
Exhibit Y:	Plaintiffs’ February 24, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin .....	1216
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail .....	1217a, 841
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “adjournment request & notice to Attorney General” .....	1217a, 842
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail....	1217a, 843
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns” .....	1217a, 844
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail....	1217a, 845
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you” .....	1217a, 846
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review” .....	1217a, 847
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail....	1217a, 848
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?” .....	1217a, 849
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail ...	1217a, 850
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED” .....	1217a, 851
	AAG Supervisor Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED” .....	1217a, 858

Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN” .....	1217a, 859
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law” .....	1217a, 863
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman” .....	1217a, 868
Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED” .....	1217a, 870
Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.” .....	1217a, 873
Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “...Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10” .....	1217a, 875
Exhibit Z: webpages from CJA’s website, <a href="http://www.judgewatch.org">www.judgewatch.org</a> :	
<i>Doris L. Sassower v. Mangano</i> federal action .....	1218
<i>Elena Sassower v. New York Times</i> state action .....	1227
<i>Elena Sassower v. Commission on Judicial Conduct</i> Article 78 proceeding .....	1236
Exhibit AA: “ <i>Refusal to Apologize Costs Judicial Watchdog 6 Months</i> ” ( <i>New York Law Journal</i> , July 8, 2004, at p. 1).....	1244
reprinted as “ <i>Whistleblower of Judicial Misconduct is Put in Jail For 6 Months: They REALLY do not like criticism of any kind</i> ” (ParentAdvocates.org) .....	1245
Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition and in Support of Cross-Motion .....	1247
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ July 27, 2017 Letter to Judge Hartman, “...&amp; NOTICE TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL”</u></b> .....	1282
<b><u>Judge Hartman’s August 7, 2017 So-Ordered Letter</u></b> .....	1292

<b><u>Plaintiffs’ August 25, 2017 Reply</u></b>	
<b><u>in Further Support of their June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u></b>	
<b><u>and in Opposition to Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Cross-Motion</u></b> ..... 1274	
Plaintiff Sassower’s August 25, 2017 Affidavit in Reply and in Opposition.....	1274
Exhibit H-1: Plaintiffs’ July 27, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman, “...& NOTICE TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL” .....	1282
Exhibit H-2: Judge Hartman’s August 7, 2017 So-Ordered Letter .....	1292
<b>Exhibit I: Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....</b>	<b>1293</b>
Exhibit J: Plaintiffs’ June 16, 2017 complaint to Commission on Judicial Conduct: “Conflict-of-interest/corruption complaint against Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman for willfully violating judicial disclosure/disqualification rules in order to ‘throw’ a citizen-taxpayer action in which she is financially interested & has personal and professional relationships with defendants” .....	1320
<b>Plaintiffs’ August 25, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Reply</b>	
<b>&amp; in Opposition to Cross-Motion</b> ..... 1328	
Affidavits of Service for Plaintiffs’ Reply Affidavit & Memorandum of Law, with transmitting e-mails –	
“I hereby reiterate the NOTICE that I gave you on July 27, 2017, to WITHDRAW AAG KERWIN’s OPPOSITION/CROSS-MOTION – which is your duty to do, as likewise, to join in plaintiffs’ application, by their August 25 <sup>th</sup> reply papers, for Judge Hartman’s disqualification and vacatur of her decision/orders – all fraudulent” .....	1383
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ Stipulation in Lieu of Certification Pursuant to CPLR §5532</u></b>	