NEW YORK SUPREME COURT

Appellate Division - Second Department

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER, individually and as Coordinator of the Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc., CENTER FOR JUDICIAL ACCOUNTABILITY, INC., and The Public as represented by them,

App Div. #2006-8091 #2006-10709 #2007-186

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

-against-

Westchester Co. #19841/05

THE NEW YORK TIMES COMPANY, The New York Times, ARTHUR SULZBERGER, JR., BILL KELLER, JILL ABRAMSON, ALLAN M. SIEGAL, GAIL COLLINS, individually and on behalf of THE EDITORIAL BOARD, DANIEL OKRENT, BYRON CALAME, MAREK FUCHS, and DOES 1-20,

Defendants-Respondents.

RECORD ON APPEAL

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER, *Pro Se*Individually & for The Public
16 Lake Street, Apartment 2C
White Plains, New York 10603
Tel: 914-421-1200

OT APR 23 PM 5: 34
APPELLATE DIVISION
SECOND DEPARTMENT

ELI VIGLIANO, Esq.

Attorney for CENTER FOR JUDICIAL ACCOUNTABILITY, INC., & for Plaintiff ELENA RUTH SASSOWER as Coordinator, & for The Public

4901 Henry Hudson Parkway Bronx, New York 10471 Tel: 718-884-3747

RECORD ON APPEAL

Statement Pursua	ant to CPLR §5531xii
Plaintiffs-Appell	ants' Notice of Appeal, dated August 21, 2006
	ants' Request for Appellate Division Intervention, , 2006
	rder of Westchester County Court Judge/"Acting Supreme Court E. Loehr, dated July 5, 2006
Ex Parte Judgm	ent signed by the Westchester County Clerk, dated August 1, 2006
Plaintiffs-Appell	ants' Notice of Appeal, dated December 21, 2006
	ants' Request for Appellate Division Intervention, 21, 2006
	rder of Westchester County Court Judge/"Acting Supreme Court
Justice" Geraid	Loehr, dated September 27, 2006
PLAINTIFFS' V	VERIFIED COMPLAINT, dated March 21, 2006, and supporting
PLAINTIFFS' V	VERIFIED COMPLAINT, dated March 21, 2006, and supporting
PLAINTIFFS' Vexhibits	WERIFIED COMPLAINT, dated March 21, 2006, and supporting "When the Judge Sledgehammered The Gadfly", New York Times, Westchester Section, front-page, November 7, 2004
PLAINTIFFS' Vexhibits	WERIFIED COMPLAINT, dated March 21, 2006, and supporting "When the Judge Sledgehammered The Gadfly", New York Times, Westchester Section, front-page, November 7, 2004

	(4) Plaintiffs' February 7, 2003 e-mail/memo to Eleanor Randolph, <u>NYT</u> Editorial Board [w/o enclosures]	199
	(5) Plaintiffs' February 11, 2003 proposed Letter to the Editor	200
	(6) Plaintiffs' March 6, 2003 e-mail/memo to Eleanor Randolph, NYT Editorial Board [w/o enclosures]	205
Ex. B:	Plaintiffs' June 11, 2003 memorandum-complaint to NYT Editorial Board	206
Ex. C-1:	CJA's website homepage "Paper Trail Documenting the Corruption of Federal Judicial Selection/Confirmation", as it appeared on June 10, 2003	209
Ex. C-2:	CJA's website homepage, as it appeared on Plaintiff Sassower's 130 th day of incarceration	212
Ex. C-3:	CJA's "Paper Trail Documenting the Corruption of Federal Judicial Selection/Confirmation & the 'Disruption of Congress' Case it Spawned", as it appeared on CJA's website, without change, throughout Plaintiff Sassower's six-month incarceration from June 28, 2004 to December 23, 2004	213
Ex. D:	Plaintiffs' June 19, 2003 letter to NYT Assistant Managing Editor Allan Siegal	220
Ex. E:	CJA's webpage, "Press Suppression- <u>The New York Times</u> ", as it appeared, without change, from June 28, 2004 to December 23, 2004	225
Ex. F:	Plaintiffs' August 26, 2003 letter to Outgoing NYT Washington Bureau Chief – Incoming Managing Editor for Newsgathering Jill Abramson	232
Ex. G:	Plaintiffs' September 25, 2003 letter to NYT Executive Editor Bill Keller	240
Ex. H:	Plaintiffs' October 13, 2003 letter to NYT Executive Editor Keller	245
Ex. I:	Plaintiffs' November 1, 2003 letter to NYT Executive Editor Keller	276
Ex. J-1:	Plaintiffs' December 1, 2003 letter to NYT Public Editor Daniel Okrent	277
Ex. J-2:	Plaintiffs' December 24, 2003 e-mail to Public Editor Okrent	278

Ex. J-3:	Automated December 24, 2003 e-mail acknowledgment from Public Editor	. 279
Ex. J-4:	December 24, 2003 e-mail from Arthur Bovino, Office of Public Editor	. 280
Ex. K-1:	Plaintiffs' June 16, 2003 memorandum to Ralph Nader, Public Citizen, Common Cause	. 281
Ex. K-2:	CJA's website homepage (as of May 9, 2003), featuring the June 16, 2003 memorandum to Ralph Nader, Public Citizen, Common Cause	. 286
Ex. K-3:	CJA's website homepage, featuring the June 16, 2003 memorandum and Plaintiffs' two Letters to the Editor in Roll Call and the New York Law Journal (from May 22, 2003 to sometime after June 28, 2003)	. 287
Ex. L-1:	Plaintiffs' May 11, 2004 letter to NYT reporter Raymond Hernandez	288
Ex. L-2:	Raymond Hernandez' May 11, 2004 e-mail	292
Ex. L-3:	Plaintiffs' May 11, 2004 fax note to Hernandez	293
Ex. L-4:	Plaintiffs' May 17, 2004 e-mail to Hernandez	294
Ex. M:	Plaintiffs' May 24, 2004 memorandum to Gerry Mulaney, <u>NYT</u> Deputy Metro Editor for Politics	296
Ex. N:	Plaintiffs' June 17, 2004 memorandum-complaint to Public Editor Okrent	301
Ex. O-1:	Plaintiffs' June 17, 2004 e-mail to Public Editor Okrent (3:21 p.m.)	306
Ex. O-2:	June 17, 2004 automated acknowledgment (3:28 p.m.)	307
Ex. O-3:	Arthur Bovino's June 17, 2004 e-mail to Plaintiffs (3:34 p.m.)	308
Ex. O-4:	Plaintiffs' June 17, 2004 e-mail to Bovino (4:29 p.m.)	309
Ex. O-5:	Arthur Bovino's June 17, 2004 e-mail to Plaintiffs (4:43 p.m.)	310
Ex. O-6:	Plaintiffs' June 17, 2004 e-mail to Bovino (5:56 p.m.)	311
Ex. O-7:	Arthur Bovino's June 17, 2004 e-mail to Plaintiffs (10:12 p.m.)	312
Ex. O-8:	Plaintiffs' June 18, 2004 e-mail to Bovino (2:27 p.m.)	313

Ex. O-9:	Plaintiffs' June 20, 2004 e-mail (4:22 p.m.)	314
Ex. O-10:	Daniel Okrent's June 21, 2004 e-mail to Plaintiffs (11:16 a.m.)	315
Ex. O-11:	Plaintiffs' June 22, 2004 e-mail to Okrent (9:32 a.m.)	316
Ex. O-12:	Arthur Bovino's June 22, 2004 e-mail to CJA (9:47 a.m.)	317
Ex. O-13:	Plaintiffs' June 22, 2004 e-mail to Bovino (10:48 a.m.)	318
Ex. O-14:	Arthur Bovino's June 22, 2004 e-mail to CJA (11:14 a.m.)	319
Ex. O-15:	Plaintiffs' June 22, 2004 e-mail to Arthur (3:07 p.m.)	320
Ex. P:	Plaintiffs' June 25, 2004 e-mail (cc) to Public Editor Okrent, Gerry Mulaney, Philip Taubman, Raymond Hernandez, Neil Lewis	321
Ex. Q:	Plaintiffs' July 29, 2005 letter to <u>NYT</u> Executive Editor Bill Keller 3	331
Ex. R-1:	Plaintiffs' August 16, 2005 memorandum to <u>NYT</u> recipients	39
Ex. R-2:	Plaintiffs' March 26, 2003 written statement of opposition to the confirmation of New York Court of Appeals Judge Richard C. Wesley to the Second Circuit Court of Appeals & P. Kevin Castel, Esq. to the District Court of the Southern District of New York	341
Ex. S-1:	Plaintiffs' September 26, 2005 letter to <u>NYT</u> Public Editor Byron Calame	69
Ex. S-2:	Public Editor Calame's September 30, 2005 e-mail	75
Ex. T-1:	Plaintiffs' November 30, 2005 letter to NYT Co. Assistant General Counsel George Freeman	76
Ex. T-2:	George Freeman's December 2, 2005 letter, with envelope postmarked December 6, 2005	78
Ex. T-3:	Plaintiffs' December 14, 2005 letter to George Freeman	81
Ex. T-4:	Plaintiffs' December 22, 2005 letter to George Freeman	84
Ex. T-5:	Plaintiffs' December 30, 2005 letter to NYT Co. Senior Vice President & General Counsel Solomon B. Watson, IV	85
Ex. T-6:	George Freeman's January 3, 2006 letter	87

Ex. T-7:	Plaintiffs' January 6, 2006 letter to Solomon B. Watson, IV
Ex. T-8:	Plaintiffs' January 12, 2006 letter to Solomon B. Watson, IV, with Plaintiffs' November 1, 2005 letter to Legal Assistant Edward Bohan & November 4, 2005 letter to Senior Counsel David McCraw
Ex. T-9:	David McCraw's January 12, 2006 e-mail
Ex. T-10:	George Freeman's January 10, 2006 letter
Ex. T-11:	Plaintiffs' January 13, 2006 letter to David McCraw
Ex. T-12:	David McCraw's January 13, 2006 e-mail
Ex. T-13:	Plaintiffs' January 16, 2006 letter to David McCraw
Ex. T-14:	David McCraw's January 17, 2006 e-mail
Ex. T-15:	Plaintiffs' January 19, 2006 letter to David McCraw
Ex. T-16:	Plaintiffs' January 24, 2006 letter to NYT Co. Senior Vice President & Chief Legal Officer Solomon B. Watson, IV
Ex. T-17:	Plaintiffs' January 27, 2006 letter to Solomon B. Watson, IV 406
Ex. T-18:	Plaintiffs' January 30, 2006 letter to NYT Co. Secretary, Corporate Governance Officer & Senior Counsel Rhonda L. Brauer
Ex. T-19:	Plaintiffs' February 3, 2006 memo to all individual defendants except Okrent
Ex. T-20:	Plaintiffs' February 13, 2006 letter to Edward Bohan
Ex. T-21:	Plaintiffs' February 14, 2006 letter to Solomon B. Watson, IV and Rhonda Brauer
Ex. T-22:	Plaintiffs' March 2, 2006 letter to Edward Bohan
	v

DEFENDANTS'	NOTICE OF MOTION TO DISMISS, dated April 13, 2006	415
	FIDAVIT OF GEORGE FREEMAN, ESQ., sworn to April 12, 2006, ag exhibits	417
Ex. A:	(supposed) transcript excerpt of U.S. Senate Judiciary Committee's May 22, 2003 judicial confirmation hearing	419
Ex. B:	transcript of June 28, 2004 sentencing in USA v. Elena Sassower	421
DEFENDANT	TS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW, dated April 13, 2006	446
REFERRALS, DISSUMMARY JUDG	OTICE OF CROSS-MOTION FOR SANCTIONS, DISCIPLINARY SQUALIFICATION OF COUNSEL, DEFAULT JUDGMENT, GMENT & OTHER RELIEF, dated June 1, 2006	469
	hibits	472
Ex. U:	November 16, 2005 program of New York University Law School Alumni Association, "Freedom of the Press or License to Libel: Balancing Freedom of the Press with an Individual's Right to Protect 'A Good Name' from Defamatory Statements"	492
Ex. V-1:	Summons with Notice, dated & filed November 4, 2005	494
Ex. V-2:	Affidavit of Service of Richard P. Simmonds, sworn to February 23, 2006, filed March 3, 2006.	496
Ex. V-3:	Affidavit of Service of Robert Haak, sworn to February 28, 2006, filed March 16, 2006.	500
Ex. W:	George Freeman's Notice of Appearance and Demand for Complaint, dated March 1, 2006	502
Ex. X-1:	Elena Sassower's March 9, 2006 letter to George Freeman	505
Ex. X-2:	Elena Sassower's March 15, 2006 letter to George Freeman	507
Ex. X-3:	George Freeman's March 14, 2006 letter to Elena Sassower	509
Ex. X-4:	Elena Sassower's March 17, 2006 letter to George Freeman	510
Ex. X-5:	Postmarked envelope from New York Times Company, March 20, 2006	513

Ex. Y:	Plaintiff's Verified Complaint, dated March 21, 2006 with Affirmation of Service of Eli Vigliano, Esq., filed March 30, 2006	. 514
Ex. Z-1:	Elena Sassower's April 17, 2006 letter to George Freeman	. 516
Ex. Z-2:	George Freeman's April 18, 2006 letter to Elena Sassower	. 517
Ex. Z-3:	Elena Sassower's May 1, 2006 letter to George Freeman	. 518
Ex. Z-4:	George Freeman's May 8, 2006 letter to Elena Sassower	. 521
Ex. Z-5:	Elena Sassower's May 23, 2006 letter to George Freeman	. 522
Ex. Z-6:	George Freeman's May 23, 2006 e-mail to Elena Sassower	. 524
Ex. AA-1:	Coverpage and 2-page excerpt of U.S. Senate Judiciary Committee's June 25, 1996 hearing – with handwritten "Ex 'H'" and numbering 46-48 – downloaded from CJA's website "Paper Trail to Jail": Elena Sassower's May 21, 2003 letter to Capitol Police	. 525
Ex. AA-2:	CJA's website "Paper Trail to Jail", as it appeared in the weeks preceding Mr. Freeman's April 13, 2006 dismissal motion	. 528
Ex. BB-1:	Elena Sassower's June 30, 1992 letter to Arthur Sulzberger, Jr., enclosing her June 30, 1992 complaint to New York City Department of Consumer Affairs and Sulzberger's January 17, 1992 editorial statement "From the Publisher"	. 535
Ex. BB-2:	July 14, 1992 letter from Solomon B. Watson, IV to New York City Department of Consumer Affairs	540
Ex. BB-3:	July 15, 1992 letter from Arthur Sulzberger, Jr. to Elena Sassower	541
	MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN OPPOSITION TO DISMISSAL OF CROSS-MOTION, dated June 1, 2006	542
	AN'S REPLY AFFIDAVIT, sworn to June 9, 2006, and supporting	609
Ex. A:	transcript pages from U.S. Senate Judiciary Committee's May 22, 2003 judicial confirmation hearing	615

PLAINTIFF SASS	SOWER'S REPLY AFFIDAVIT, sworn to June 13, 2006	620
Articles Handed-U	Jp at June 14, 2006 Oral Argument:	
and Negligenc	Malpractice: Suing Jayson Blair and the New York Times for Fraud re" by Professors Clay Calvert and Robert D. Richards, tellectual Property, Media & Entertainment Law Journal 1 (2003)	634
	Press – A New First Amendment Right" by Professor Jerome Barron, w Review 1641 (1967)	662
REARGUMENT/I	OTICE OF MOTION FOR DISQUALIFICATION/DISCLOSURE; RENEWAL; VACATUR OF THE JUDGMENT & OTHER Igust 21, 2006	700
	SASSOWER'S MOVING AFFIDAVIT, sworn to August 21, 2006, g exhibits	703
Ex. CC:	Judge Gerald E. Loehr's July 5, 2006 decision and order	7
Ex. DD:	Administrative Judge Nicolai's May 8, 2006 notice assigning the case to "Acting Supreme Court Justice" Loehr	721
Ex. EE:	Ex Parte Judgment signed by Westchester County Clerk, August 1, 2006	722
Ex. FF:	Request for Judicial Intervention (RJI), filed with Westchester County Clerk's Office on April 25, 2006, by George Freeman, Esq., on behalf of defendants The New York Times Company, et al.	724
Ex. GG-1:	Supreme Court Justice Smith's August 4, 2004 recusal order in George Sassower v. Feltman, Karesh, Major & Farbman, et al. (Index #20421-92)	726
Ex. GG-2:	Supreme Court Justice LaCava's April 16, 2004 recusal order in George Sassower v. Feltman, Karesh, Major & Farbman, et al. (Index #20421-92)	728
Ех. НН:	"Veteran Democrats bid to unseat Republican judges", The Journal News, October 27, 2004.	729
Ex. II:	"Politicos pay tribute to a poster boy of cronyism: Tax cheat Arred gets a big turnout at party", The Journal News, August 1, 2006	730

Ex. JJ:	Doris L. Sassower's published Letter to the Editor, <u>The Westchester</u> <u>Crusader</u> , April 8, 2004	731
Ex. KK-1:	CJA's webpage of Castracan v. Colavita	733
Ex. KK-2:	CJA's webpage "Paper Trail of Suppression, Protectionism, & Blackballing" by <u>The New York Times</u> from 1990 and 1991	736
Ex. LL-1:	Doris L. Sassower's October 24, 1991 letter to Governor Cuomo, with enclosures, filed as a judicial misconduct complaint with NYS Commission on Judicial Conduct	737
	1989 three-year judge-trading cross-endorsements deal	747
	Doris L. Sassower's Letter to the Editor, "Cross-Endorsement: Questions of Protection", New York Times, June 9, 1991	750
	Doris L. Sassower's column "Judicial-Selection Panels: An Exercise in Futility?", New York Law Journal, September 22, 1971	751
	Doris L. Sassower's 1989 <u>Martindale-Hubbell Law Directory</u> listing	752
Ex. LL-2:	Commission on Judicial Conduct's January 7, 1991 letter dismissing the October 24, 1991 judicial misconduct complaint	753
Ex. MM:	"Where Do You Go When Judges Break the Law?", CJA's \$16,770 public interest ad on The New York Times' Op-Ed page of October 26, 1994	754
Ex. NN-1:	CJA's March 4, 2003 facially-meritorious and documented judicial misconduct complaint	755
Ex. NN-2:	Commission on Judicial Conduct's June 19, 2003 letter dismissing the March 4, 2003 judicial misconduct complaint	774
Ex. OO:	"Westchester's Matrimonial Part Revamped in Wake of Infighting", New York Law Journal, June 26, 2006, front page	775
Ex. PP-1:	Plaintiff Sassower's August 7, 2006 letter to Westchester County Clerk Timothy C. Idoni	778
Ex. PP-2:	August 8, 2006 letter of Westchester County Deputy Clerk John J.	783

DISQUALIFIC	MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CATION/DISCLOSURE; REARGUMENT/RENEWAL; THE JUDGMENT & OTHER RELIEF, dated August 21, 2006	784
_	Analysis of the "Deemed True" Allegations of the Verified Complay the July 5, 2006 Decision & Order	
	AN'S AFFIDAVIT IN OPPOSITION,	837
	OWER'S REPLY AFFIDAVIT, sworn to September 25, 2006, ibits	843
Ex. QQ-1:	George Freeman's August 29, 2006 e-mail to Plaintiff Sassower	862
Ex. QQ-2:	Plaintiff Sassower's August 31, 2006 letter to Mr. Freeman	863
Ex. QQ-3:	George Freeman's August 31, 2006 e-mail to Plaintiff Sassower	864
Ex. QQ-4:	George Freeman's September 19, 2006 e-mail to Plaintiff Sassower	865
Ex. QQ-5:	September 19, 2006 Federal Express label for overnight delivery to Plaintiff Sassower from New York Times	866
Ex. RR:	"Institutional Reckless Disregard for Truth in Public Defamation Actions Against the Press" by Professors Randall P Bezanson and Gilbert Cranberg, 90 <u>Iowa Law Review</u> 887 (March 2005)	867
	TICE OF ENTRY OF SEPTEMBER 27, 2006 DECISION & mber 21, 2006	901
Westchester County	Clerk's Computerized Docket Sheet	903
	SUPPLEMENTAL DOCUMENTS:	
	vember 22, 2006 letter to Michael Colodner, Counsel/Unified Court	904
	vember 27, 2006 letter to John Eiseman, Record Access Officer, ied Court System	905

Elena Sassower's November 28, 2006 letter to William D. Dahl/Unified Court System	908
William Dahl's September 29, 2006 letter to Kevin McKeown	910
December 29, 2004 Administrative Order of Chief Administrative Judge Jonathan Lippman, signed by Presiding Justice Gail Prudenti	911
2005 Judicial Assignments-Ninth Judicial District	912
December 20, 2005 Administrative Order of Chief Administrative Judge Jonathan Lippman, signed by Presiding Justice Gail Prudenti	913
Judges "Cross Assigned"	914
2006 Judicial Assignments-Ninth Judicial District	. 915
August 11, 2005 notice, signed by Administrative Judge Francis Nicolai, assigning Judge Loehr to the Surrogate Proceedings of Mary McKeown	916
September 22, 2006 e-mail from Kevin McKeown to William Dahl	. 917
John Eiseman's December 14, 2006 letter to Elena Sassower	. 918
Elena Sassower's December 29, 2006 letter to Michael Colodner, Counsel & Appeals Officer/Unified Court System	. 920
January 4, 2007 letter from Lawrence K. Marks, Administrative Director/Unified Court System to Elena Sassower	. 924
Elena Sassower's February 2, 2007 letter to Michael Colodner	. 925
William Dahl's February 22, 2006 letter to Elena Sassower	. 930
Elena Sassower's March 20, 2007 letter to Michael Colodner	. 931
John Eiseman's March 22, 2007 letter to Elena Sassower	. 932
* * *	
Certification of Eli Vigliano, Esq. Pursuant to CPLR §2105	. 936