1			Χ
2	PUBLIC HEARING	ON THE MORELAND COMMISSION	
3	TO INVESTIGATE	PUBLIC CORRUPTION.	
4			Χ
5		One Pace Plaza	
6		New York, New York	
7			
8		September 17, 2013	
9		6:05 P.M.	
10			
11			
12			
13			
14	Reported By:		
15	Stefanie Krut		
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

2

Τ	APPEARANCES:	
2	COMMISSIONE	RS PRESENT:
3	K	athleen Rice - Co-Chair
4	М	ilton Williams, Jr Co-Chair
5	W	illiam Fitzpatrick - Co-Chair
6	J	oanne Mahoney
7	E	ric Corngold
8	М	akau Mutua
9	D	erek Champagne
10	P	atrick Barrett
11	N	ancy Hoppock
12	S	eymour James
13	G	erald Mollen
14	В	etty Weinberg Ellerin
15	K	athleen Hogan
16	D	avid Javdan
17	В	enito Romano
18	K	risty Sprague
19	R	ichard Briffault
20	P	. David Soares
21	P	eter Zimroth
22	R	obert Johnson
23	В	arbara Bartoletti - Special Adviso:
24	R	egina Calcaterra - Executive
25	D	irector

- 1 The public frustration and anger with corruption has reached
- 2 the breaking point, and the Governor recognized that. The
- 3 citizens of New York are fed up with seeing the taxes on
- 4 their hard-earned money used as political spoils. In our
- 5 troubled economy, they are no longer willing to tolerate the
- 6 specter of political payoffs, triumph of their trust and
- 7 their sweat equity in the competitive effort for simple
- 8 success in business cannot be determined by who made the
- 9 biggest campaign contribution. They want a fair shake, a
- 10 fair chance. They simply want, as was said 150 years ago,
- 11 about 200 miles from here, when a graveyard was being
- 12 consecrated, they want a government of the People, by the
- 13 People and for the People. Is that really too much to ask
- 14 for? That's what Governor Cuomo has charged us to do, and
- 15 that's what we fully intend to do; to complete his vision of
- 16 restoring the political trust of the People in their own
- 17 government.
- Now let me have the pleasure of introducing a great
- 19 American who has done as much to restore that integrity as
- 20 any other New Yorker. I suspect that sometimes our first
- 21 speaker must feel like Diogenes walking through the halls of
- 22 Albany with a lantern looking for an honest man. On May
- 23 15th of 2009 our President and First Staff nominated Preet
- 24 Bharara to become the United States Attorney for the
- 25 Southern District of New York. Mr. Bharara's nomination was

1 unanimously confirmed by the US Senate on August the 7th,

- 2 2009, and he was sworn in on August the 13th, 2009. Under
- 3 his supervision, the office has remained at the forefront of
- 4 prosecuting corruption, not only in New York City, but
- 5 throughout the State. Notable public corruption defendants
- 6 include New York State Senators Malcolm Smith, Carl Kruger,
- 7 Vincent Leibell and Ira Monserate; New York City
- 8 Assemblymen, Eric Stevenson and Nelson Castro; and New York
- 9 City Councilmen, Larry Seabrook and Dan Halloran. The
- 10 office has also prosecuted more than 500 members and
- 11 associations who are associated with various gangs
- 12 throughout the Southern District of New York. It is my
- 13 great pleasure, and I welcome you very, very much, to
- 14 introduce Preet Bharara, the United States Attorney.
- 15 MR. BHARARA: Thank you very much. Chairman
- 16 Fitzpatrick, Rice, and Williams, distinguished members of
- 17 the Moreland Commission, US Attorney Lynch, US Attorney
- 18 Vance, and members of the public, it is a real privilege to
- 19 be here today. I have never testified in a forum like this
- 20 before, and I must admit I feel kind of outnumbered, but
- 21 when the Commission reached out to me, I leapt at the
- 22 chance, because you are engaged in an effort that is dear to
- 23 my heart, not just as a prosecutor, but as a New Yorker. As
- 24 I have made clear to the Commission, I pledge the
- 25 cooperation and assistance of my office with the

1 I want to report briefly on one development in that

- 2 regard, as it potentially raises an issue for this
- 3 Commission's consideration. Our primary mission is to
- 4 address and to undue injustice. In the public corruption
- 5 context, a galling injustice that sticks in the craw of
- 6 every thinking New Yorker, is the almost inviable right of
- 7 even the most corrupt elected official, even after being
- 8 convicted by a jury and jailed by a judge, to draw a
- 9 publically funded pension until his dying day. That error
- 10 of state law, partially fixed a couple of years ago, must
- 11 succumb to common sense. The common sense principle is a
- 12 simple one. Convicted politicians should not grow old
- 13 comfortably cushioned by a pension paid for by the very
- 14 people they betrayed in office.
- 15 So my office has adopted a new set of policies.
- 16 First, going forward, we will seek appropriate fines to take
- 17 into account the money a corrupt official might derive from
- 18 a publically funded pension so that the punishment fits the
- 19 crime and so that we can take the profit out of that crime.
- 20 Second, for those defendants previously convicted and who
- 21 have failed to satisfy the financial obligations imposed by
- 22 sentencing, we will consider federal civil forfeiture
- 23 actions against their pensions to satisfy criminal
- 24 judgments. And finally, in pending and in future cases, to
- 25 the extent that any public official has intentionally

1 accrued while engaging in criminal conduct, we will use this

- 2 federal forfeiture law to claw back an appropriate dollar
- 3 amount commensurate with that pension, where appropriate.
- 4 In that vein, we have today filed bills of particulars in
- 5 two pending corruption cases, the United States versus
- 6 Malcolm Smith, et al, and United States versus Eric
- 7 Stevenson, et al, giving notice of our intent to go after
- 8 the pensions of elected officials convicted of corruption
- 9 charges.
- 10 If there is a way for state law to be further
- 11 modified to accomplish this end with respect to politicians
- 12 elected prior to 2011, the Commission should consider it,
- 13 because I think New Yorkers would welcome it. In the
- 14 meantime, we will pursue this strategy that I have just
- 15 outlined.
- 16 As for other issues for the Commission to consider,
- 17 given the collective experience and expertise of new
- 18 members, it seems a bit presumptuous for someone like me to
- 19 offer any advice or counsel, but in the few minutes I have
- 20 this evening, let me just make three quick observations
- 21 based on some of our experiences in the US Attorney's Office
- 22 in the Southern District of New York.
- 23 First, when District Attorney Rice last month said
- 24 the Commission would follow the money, New Yorkers had
- 25 reason to cheer, but it is harder for us to do that when the

2 -

1.7

1 money trails are purposely hidden. When every state or

- 2 local official today has a lawyer or accountant and they
- 3 lawfully withhold the details of that work, prosecutors
- 4 naturally face substantial challenges, and that's why God
- 5 made the subpoena. And it is heartening to see its
- 6 appropriately aggressive use to track the flow of money in
- 7 politics, so please keep asking those questions you referred
- 8 to in your opening.
- 9 Second, public hearings are important and policy
- 10 proposals are important also, but so are hard nosed
- 11 investigations and prosecutions, which I hope will be a
- 12 primary, rather than a tertiary, focus of this esteemed
- 13 Commission. Nothing shines a light brighter or focuses the
- 14 public's anger better than the actual arrest and conviction
- 15 of a corrupt politician. It was a wave of prosecutions that
- 16 reportedly spurred this Commission's creation in the first
- 17 place, and worthy prosecutions, I believe, will ratify the
- 18 importance of your ongoing work and rally support for your
- 19 ultimate recommendations. As the Commission does its deep
- 20 dive, my office stands ready to prosecute any appropriate
- 21 case that you may refer, especially given our track record
- 22 of success, our access to resources, our tough penalty
- 23 provisions and our reputation for nonpartisanship, same as
- 24 the reputation of the Eastern District of New York led by
- 25 Loretta Lynch.

1 Third, sometimes when dealing with big crime

- 2 problems, it is important not to overlook the small things.
- 3 The overlooking of seemingly small things can, over time,
- 4 breed a dangerous disrespect for the rule of law. As with
- 5 every category of criminal conduct, too often it is the
- 6 accumulation of small and seemingly minor things, minor
- 7 violations that lead to widespread lawlessness. That is the
- 8 essential insight of the broken window's theory, famously
- 9 posited by James P. Wilson, and there seems to be a bit of
- 10 that going on with our campaign finance laws here in New
- 11 York, unfortunately. Take the case of campaign free files.
- 12 State election law requires every reticent political
- 13 committee that receives or spends any money in connection
- 14 with an election to file a sworn statement with the New York
- 15 State Board of Elections. These filings require just the
- 16 most basic information about contributions received and
- 17 expenditures incurred by the committee. While a relatively
- 18 basic requirement designed to ensure some level of
- 19 transparency in state elections, this counts for more than
- 20 100 campaign committees didn't even bother to file the
- 21 statement. And what was the consequence? A nominal fine,
- 22 which in many cases may be impossible to enforce because the
- 23 committees often disband after most elections. The
- 24 Commission might do well to begin by focusing on the broken
- 25 windows all around.

1 Ultimately, the members of this Commission have, as

- 2 has already been said many times, an absolutely daunting
- 3 mission. It is your town's amidst high hopes to hold public
- 4 officials to account, to expose obscure errors of greed and
- 5 to restore faith in our government. That is a tall order.
- 6 At the end of the day and all things, toughness and
- 7 independence will payoff. When people understand that no
- 8 one is immune from appropriate investigation or inquiry,
- 9 whether the majority or in the minority, whether in the
- 10 upper chamber or in the lower, whether in the legislative or
- 11 in the executive branch, then there will be a measure of
- 12 respect and fear and perhaps even deterrence. That is true
- 13 for the prosecutor's office, and it is also true for the
- 14 Moreland Commission.
- 15 Of course, as I have said before, public corruption
- 16 in New York is more than a prosecutor's problem. No one
- 17 prosecutor can fix it. No one Commission can fix it either.
- 18 The public and the press have a role to play also, and this
- 19 Commission, with a bigger bully pulpit than any individual
- 20 prosecutor or politician, can encourage public engagement.
- 21 So to repeat a longstanding comment of investigative
- 22 journalists, I think they have become a dying breed,
- 23 although there are still a few extraordinary practitioners,
- 24 some of who I think are here and watching this evening. But
- 25 with each press outlet that closes or downsizes,

1 opportunities to ferret out fraud and waste and abuse are

- 2 lost, and that is too bad because, as Edward R. Murrow once
- 3 observed, quote, "a nation of sheep will beget a government
- 4 of wolves." But maybe the ranks of investigative
- 5 journalists will be fortified. Maybe those with purpose in
- 6 the capital of New York, an infusion of staff and resources
- 7 will mean more Albany upgrading, maybe Jeff Bezos' purchase
- 8 of the Washington Post and his recorded interest in
- 9 rejuvenating a story history of eye popping investigations
- 10 will prove contagious, and maybe fresh new outlets whose
- 11 editors are bent on doubling down on political
- 12 investigations, will provide grist for commissions like this
- 13 one. We shall see.
- 14 Meanwhile, in cooperation and coordination with the
- 15 important work of this Commission, we will continue to
- 16 prosecute those who perpetuate, continue to perpetuate a
- 17 show me the money culture in Albany. Thank you very much.
- 18 MR. FITZPATRICK: Any questions from the
- 19 Commissioners or staff? Derek?
- 20 MR. CHAMPAGNE: Thank you. Thank you for coming
- 21 out tonight, United States Attorney. You spoke about, just
- 22 a moment ago, the show me the money culture in Albany, and I
- 23 know you have referenced that in the past. If our
- 24 Commission ultimately concluded that this culture is
- 25 essentially unchecked and unfettered by the State Board of

1 Elections and we determine that the agency is further

- 2 underfunded and understaffed, subject to political
- 3 manipulation and rampant resources to investigate this
- 4 conduct, as we have discussed, which essentially requires,
- 5 unfortunately, federal agencies to get involved, such as
- 6 yourself, would you have an opinion or a thought as far as
- 7 could we or should we recommend the Department of Justice
- 8 open a pattern and practice investigation into the culture?
- 9 MR. BHARARA: I have certainly said many times that
- 10 the culture in various institutions is a problem. That
- 11 culture matters. Perhaps it's premature to make any
- 12 ultimate conclusion about things because this is the opening
- 13 ceremony of your Commission. Certainly there is a role for
- 14 the federal government to play, and I think, you know, I and
- 15 Loretta Lynch and others have played that role in going
- 16 after particular cases of corruption and in cases where it's
- 17 more systemic, we have a role to play there as well. With
- 18 respect to your mentioning of a pattern and practice suit by
- 19 the Department of Justice, I am not at this moment aware of
- 20 the circumstances from which that has been done in the
- 21 context like this one. Generally speaking, that's the kind
- 22 of thing the federal government gets involved in when you
- 23 are talking about a civil or constitutional rights
- 24 violation, and that's something that certainly the
- 25 Department of Justice doesn't shy away from, when it's

1 expenditures and about income, because people can have other

- 2 jobs when they are still in the legislature is something
- 3 that's surprising sometimes, and if it challenges the people
- 4 like us, and all of you as well, and there are other states
- 5 that report more transparency, so it would be sometimes
- 6 surprising that in an open democracy, in a system that
- 7 America is supposed, where some others are considered to be
- 8 good and where public affairs are supposed to be out in the
- 9 open and not in the back room, that there is so much secrecy
- 10 surrounding basic things, basic transactions. That probably
- 11 wouldn't be -
- 12 MR. JAVDAN: Thank you.
- MR. FITZPATRICK: I just want to note also that DA
- 14 Vance is going to be addressing New York State law in that
- 15 area in a few moments. Anymore questions? Barbara?
- 16 MS. BARTOLETTI: Thank you again for being here
- 17 tonight. You talked about changing of the law where, in
- 18 regards to pensions. We also know that many of the elected
- 19 officials who then go on to be indicted and go on trial also
- 20 use their campaign committee funds to fund their legal fees.
- 21 Is that something that you would recommend that either needs
- 22 to be changed? And is that something that you have looked
- 23 at in the course of your indicting and prosecuting these
- 24 elected officials that jumps out at you as a problem?
- 25 MR. BHARARA: I have no formal opinion on that

1 because there is a lot of secrecy and a lot of things that

- 2 shroud where that money goes. And I think if there was a
- 3 better accounting of where that money goes and what time
- 4 period and how it matches with other actions that are
- 5 engaged in by public officials, that would help enormously
- 6 as well.
- 7 MR. FITZPATRICK: Anyone else? Again, thank you
- 8 very, very much. We know you have another engagement. You
- 9 are very kind to share your time with us, and it's very
- 10 comforting to know that the right man is in charge in the
- 11 Southern District.
- 12 MR. BHARARA: Thank you very much.
- MR. FITZPATRICK: We are very fortunate tonight to
- 14 have, as our second speaker, another legendary name in law
- 15 enforcement in the State of New York. Our speaker Loretta
- 16 Lynch had a storied career as a litigator in the Eastern
- 17 District of New York, United States Attorney's Office.
- 18 While in the Long Island office, Loretta prosecuted white
- 19 collar crimes, public corruption cases, and she was the lead
- 20 prosecutor in a series of trials involving allegations of
- 21 public corruption in the Long Island Town of Brookhaven.
- 22 Ms. Lynch also served as the Chief Assistant where she was a
- 23 member of the trial team in the United States versus Volpe,
- 24 a five weeks civil rights case that was extremely troubling
- 25 to most of the citizens in New York City, and she was able

1 to obtain a successful guilty verdict. Ms. Lynch was

- 2 appointed by President Clinton as United States Attorney for
- 3 the Eastern District of New York and served until 2001. She
- 4 then left the office, went into a very, very distinguished
- 5 career in private practice, and luckily for us she answered
- 6 the call from President Barack Obama to return as United
- 7 States Attorney for the Eastern District of New York, this
- 8 time in 2010 when she took the oath of office. Her
- 9 jurisdiction involves cases in Brooklyn, Queens and Staten
- 10 Island, as well as Nassau and Suffolk Counties on Long
- 11 Island. She supervises a staff of approximately 170
- 12 attorneys and 150 support personnel. Please join me in
- 13 welcoming the Eastern District of New York, United States
- 14 Attorney, the Honorable Loretta Lynch.
- 15 MS. LYNCH: Thank you and good evening, Chairman
- 16 Fitzpatrick, Chairman Rice, Chairman Williams. Thank you so
- 17 much for this opportunity to speak not just to you but to
- 18 the other distinguished members of this Commission, many of
- 19 whom I count as friends, colleagues, mentors, all of whom I
- 20 applaud for your undertaking of this enterprise. This is an
- 21 important work, in fact, reviewing our State's public
- 22 corruption apparatus to determine where should you place
- 23 more leverage, where should you place more deterrent; what
- 24 should you do to combat the culture of corruption that seems
- 25 to be prevalent all around us. And we are all hopeful that

1 this Commission's efforts will lead to a greater

- 2 understanding on the part of the public and the policy
- 3 makers regarding the nature and the scope of the problem of
- 4 public corruption. But I would also add that just as
- 5 important a role for this Commission will be to serve as a
- 6 mechanism to engage the public as participants in the
- 7 efforts to stop corruption before it begins.
- Now, as the United States Attorney for the Eastern
- 9 District of New York, I am honored to lead an office with a
- 10 long tradition of fighting public corruption, an office that
- 11 has brought many of the leading faces of our times, from
- 12 Abscam, one of the first public corruption cases to utilize
- 13 undercover agents and secret tapes and the prosections of
- 14 Congressman Mario Biaggi, Party Leader Meade Esposito, and
- 15 Nassau County Political Boss Joe Margiotta in the '80s, to
- 16 the bribery prosecutions of New York City building
- 17 inspectors and the Town of Brookhaven corruption of the
- 18 '90s, to the more recent prosecutions of City Councilman
- 19 Angel Rodriguez, Nassau County Legislator Roger Corbin and
- 20 scores of city inspectors for taking bribes, to the current
- 21 cases involving bribery and extortion at all levels of state
- 22 and city governments. Our cases have highlighted the many
- 23 and varied ways that public officials have sold their
- 24 offices and their honor for pocketsful \sharp of cash.
- Our current cases continue our rich tradition of

29

- 1 protecting the public fisc and attempting to safeguard the
- 2 public's faith in the political system. That faith,
- 3 however, cannot help but be shaken by the latest chapters and
- 4 self-interest and double dealing that our office and those
- 5 of our colleagues have uncovered. In recent months, in the
- 6 Eastern District of New York alone, we have convicted the
- Wen gark State.
 7 former majority leader of the United States Senate, and we
- 8 are prosecuting a state assemblyman, whose family has served
- 9 in the state legislature since the 1970s. We have convicted
- 10 nine officials and contractors of the New York City
- 11 Department of Housing, Preservation and Development,
- 12 including the assistant commissioner who oversaw HPD's
- 13 construction programs.
- 14 These cases, present and former, show more than the
- 15 corruption that has seeped into the corner offices of the
- 16 state capital and city hall. They highlight weaknesses and
- 17 oversight and accountability that allow corruption and
- 18 provide guidance, however, for those of us looking at these
- 19 issues and insight on principles that we submit can be
- 20 effective countermeasures as you consider your work.
- 21 Based on our experience, we have identified certain
- 22 core principles that can act as effective countermeasures to
- 23 a culture of corruption. First and foremost, rules that
- 24 hold politicians accountable for the fiscal decisions that
- 25 they make with tax payer monies and require their

1 acknowledgment of their responsibilities to certify

- 2 appropriate use. Second, truly transparent financial
- 3 disclosure on the part of politicians, along with the
- 4 beneficiaries of their largesse. Third, a strong legal
- 5 framework to allow the investigation and prosecution of
- 6 corruption matters. Fourth, a clear sentencing structure to
- 7 enhance the deterrent effect. And fifth, but no less
- 8 important, a commitment from all stakeholders, including but
- 9 not limited to, law enforcement, the public, the media and
- 10 other public officials to report wrongdoing when and where
- 11 they see it.
- 12 Now, working in conjunction with our valued law
- 13 enforcement partners, we have brought several cases recently
- 14 that highlight the pervasive problem of corruption by
- 15 elected and appointed officials. Now, I, like Preet, like
- 16 DA Vance, like all of you around this table, are extremely
- 17 proud of the work done by our teams in this area, but I
- 18 can't help but be saddened by the fact of so many cases we
- 19 have seen over the past few years. Now, I'm saddened, not
- 20 so much by the fall of individuals who could have done so
- 21 much good, because they in fact brought this on themselves
- 22 with their choices. I am most saddened for their
- 23 constituents, many of whom are from historically
- 24 underrepresented community, who place their faith in their
- 25 elected officials and believe in the promises of a new day

- 1 and a brighter tomorrow because their present-day
- 2 circumstances are challenged and they see their future as
- 3 shattered.
- 4 Just last year, as was mentioned, former State Senate
- 5 Majority Leader Pedro Espada was convicted of stealing funds
- 6 from Soundview Health Clinic, a federally funded clinic he
- 7 operated in the Bronx. And as is common in so many of these
- 8 cases, this case was so much more than double dealing and
- 9 theft. It was in fact a betrayal of the trust of the people
- 10 of the Soundview neighborhood and all of his districts, an
- 11 economically challenged area of the Bronx desperately in
- 12 need of both quality healthcare and someone to represent
- 13 their interests in Albany. The tragedy of this case is that
- 14 in Pedro Espada they had neither. The citizens of the Bronx
- 15 trusted Espada with their votes and with their health. The
- 16 federal government trusted him with over one million dollars
- 17 in funding to take care of some of the needlest citizens
- 18 among us. But instead of using that money to make sure that
- 19 medical personnel were paid, that the clinic had needed
- 20 medical supplies, Espada created a scheme to divert those
- 21 funds to exposed his lavish lifestyle. Instead of
- 22 medicines, the money went for luxury cars, extravagant
- 23 dinners, vacations, parties, spa treatments, to name just a
- 24 few items. Espada was recently sentenced to five years
- 25 incarceration this past June for both his theft conviction

- 1 as well as his federal tax crimes.
- Now, there were extraordinary challenges in building
- 3 a case against Espada, which many of you at the table will
- 4 be well familiar with. Now, they no doubt played a role in
- 5 his ability to avoid his prosecution over the years, but
- 6 they do provide insight into the things that could be
- 7 focused upon as you encounter these issues. Espada
- 8 controlled Soundview throughout the government's
- 9 investigation. The Soundview employees, who relied on him
- 10 for their livelihood, refused to cooperate with, and in many
- 11 cases, obstructed the government's investigation.
- 12 Soundview's Board of Directors was packed with friends,
- 13 relatives and others, whose only qualification appeared to
- 14 be loyalty to Espada. They also worked to impede the
- 15 investigation. Further, many of the schemes were complex
- 16 and hidden behind layers of rubber-stamp approvals by the
- 17 board and the shifting ownership arrangements of shell
- 18 corporations. Our team spent more than a year sifting
- 19 through tens of thousands of documents and nearly one
- 20 terabyte of data and interviewed hundreds of witnesses to
- 21 uncover Espada's schemes.
- 22 Earlier this year, former State Senator Shirley
- 23 Huntley was sent to prison for her role in stealing funds
- 24 from a non-profit organization that she established. She
- 25 funded a group called Parents Information Network (or PIN)

1 ostensibly to help educate and assist parents of New York

- 2 City public school children in her neighborhood in Southeast
- 3 Queens. As anyone who's ever tried to gave navigate the
- 4 waters of the New York City public school system,
- 5 particularly regarding any issues of special needs and
- 6 safety, you know that this assistance is vital. But Huntley
- 7 was able to steer New York funds from her non-profit through
- 8 the member item process. Instead of providing this
- 9 assistance to the parents, the organization was used as a
- 10 vehicle for Huntley to funnel money, over \$80,000, to
- 11 herself and her family, and this was not the only
- abused

 12 educational non-profit that she used. Two other women, an
- 13 aide and niece of Ms. Huntley, operated a non-profit called
- 14 Parent Morkshop. Its stated purpose was also to assist
- 15 parents in Southeast Queens in securing quality education
- 16 for their children, and instead, it became just another
- 17 means for Shirley Huntley to funnel New York money, tax
- 18 payer money, through this organization to herself and her
- 19 family.
- 20 And in fact, when the New York State Attorney
- 21 General's Office was investigating this organization,
- 22 Huntley assisted and aided her niece in obstructing this
- 23 investigation and falsifying documents, ultimately pleading
- 24 quilty to the obstruction case brought by her partners in
- 25 the New York State Attorney General's Office.

1 Hardly the finest hours for Espada, Huntley or the

- 2 New York State Legislature. Yet both cases, we submit to
- 3 you, illustrate certain weaknesses in both the oversight of
- 4 non-profit agencies as well as the New York State member
- 5 item process. In both cases, the boards of the non-profits
- 6 were packed with the cronies of the corrupt politicians and
- 7 had neither the expertise to run the organization nor the
- 8 will to override their political patron. The audit
- 9 function, properly supposed to be independent, was so
- 10 lacking as to be virtually nonexistent, and the member item
- 11 funds were distributed with no requirement that the
- 12 sponsoring members certify that those funds were in fact
- 13 used for their stated purpose.
- 14 We see similar themes in the public information
- 15 regarding our pending cases against Assemblyman William
- 16 Boyland and State Senator John Sampson. Boyland, as $\frac{\omega}{you}$
- 17 know, is charged of soliciting over a quarter of a million
- 18 dollars in bribes to support certain real estate development
- 19 projects and was captured on undercover recordings. He has
- 20 also been charged with submitting over 65 thousand dollars
- 21 worth of fraudulent per diem and travel vouchers, claiming
- 22 to be in Albany on official business on days when he was
- 23 not, including when he was actually meeting with the
- 24 undercover agents soliciting bribes. Boyland also allegedly
- 25 used a non-profit organization, this one charged with

1 wrongdoing, rendering them significantly less effective.

- Now, my office, like Preet, like DA Vance, like so
- 3 many of you are, is committed to vigorously investigating
- 4 and prosecuting public corruption using all the
- 5 investigative tools at our disposal. We have a long history
- 6 of utilizing undercover agents, cooperating witnesses,
- 7 wiretaps and other audio and video recordings. We undertake
- 8 extensive document review that may shed light on corrupt
- 9 activities, and we will continue to use these tools to root
- 10 out bad actors and bring their crimes to light.
- But it must be stressed, particularly here,
- 12 particularly before this group, we are not alone in this
- 13 fight, nor can we be. We cannot prosecute our way out of
- 14 this problem. It is not just for prosecutors and law
- 15 enforcement agents to ferret out wrongdoing. We all have a
- 16 role to play in promoting transparency and accountability on
- 17 the part of our public officials. The public must demand
- 18 more accountability and actual honest services. The media
- 19 must remain vigilant in its scrutiny. And public officials
- 20 who see wrongdoing must not turn a blind eye and let
- 21 corruption continue. And it is to be hoped that this body
- 22 can recommend substantive changes that will work to prevent
- 23 the next major public corruption case.
- 24 We know that this Commission will focus on the
- 25 specifics of the proposed changes that will seek to do just

1 that. And we note for your consideration certain areas of

- 2 vulnerability that have been highlighted by the cases that
- 3 we have investigated. We have seen circumstances where the
- 4 outside auditors are unfamiliar with the non-profit
- 5 structure or even manipulated or deceived by corrupt board
- 6 members. Similarly, we have seen circumstances where
- 7 non-profit board are themselves ill equipped to resist a
- 8 corrupt member or politician. The truly independent audit
- 9 of non-profit agencies by qualified auditors could yield
- 10 both evidence of corruption as well as serve as a deterrent
- 11 to those who would seek to manipulate their funding stream
- 12 for corrupt purposes.
- 13 A review of both audit and board membership
- 14 requirements could indeed be a useful step. We have also
- 15 seen circumstances where our review of vendors used by
- 16 organizations that receive member item funds, as well as our
- 17 review of the employees and the salaries of those employees,
- 18 of those organizations have revealed evidence of corruption,
- 19 and we note that greater oversight and transparency in those
- 20 areas could yield both evidence of corruption as well as
- 21 serve as a deterrent effect.
- 22 Members of the Commission, I am often asked to
- 23 describe the greatest difference that I see in law
- 24 enforcement priorities between my current time as United
- 25 States Attorney and my prior appointment, and of course,

1 without a doubt, as any New Yorker knows, it is the

- 2 expansion of the department's national security practice to
- 3 encompass the goals of not just prosecuting terrorism but
- 4 preventing the next terrorist event. And although we have
- 5 not had the same fatal catalyst in this area, we must
- 6 similarly expand our focus in the public corruption arena to
- 7 prevent corruption before it occurs.
- My office remains committed to the important work of
- rooting out corrupt public officials. We support this
- 10 Commission as it seeks to fashion rules and remedies that
- 11 will not only enhance prosecutions but will also provide
- 12 earlier detection of corruption and ultimately better
- 13 deterrence. Public officials who have engaged in corruption
- 14 have not only broken the law, they have broken faith with
- 15 the public. Their actions siphon off tax payer dollars,
- 16 they deprive citizens of vital services, and they destroy
- 17 public trust in our political system.
- I commend you for undertaking this task, and I 1.8
- 19 greatly appreciate the opportunity to provide information to
- 20 this Moreland Act Commission in your efforts to focus of real
- 21 solutions to this intractable problem and to restore the
- 22 public trust. Thank you for your time and attention this
- 23 evening.
- madam US MR. FITZPATRICK: Thank you very much, District. 24
- 25 Attorney. Any questions from the commissioners? Yes?

- 1 MR. JAVDAN: I would just ask the same question I
- 2 asked before, is there anything that, you know, you think is
- 3 perhaps not illegal or that's a challenge for you under
- 4 state law that would be helpful for you in federal law that
- 5 surprises you?
- 6 MS. LYNCH: Well, I have to echo the comments of my
- 7 colleague, Preet Bharara, in that often for us the greatest
- 8 difficulty is obtaining information, and certainly it can be
- 9 surprising sometimes to learn that certain things that we
- 10 think should be publicly available information are not. And
- 11 I think for all of us who are engaged in law enforcement in
- 12 general, greater transparency is certainly a goal. I think
- 13 I would have to leave it to for you to design the specifics
- 14 of what you would change, but I do think that's a very
- 15 important area.
- 16 Similarly, I should note that, as I indicated, many
- 17 of the abuses we have seen involve abuse of the member item
- 18 process, and I will tell you, as a prosecutor, it is also
- 19 often surprising that the person who is in charge of
- 20 dispensing such largesse home organizations does not seem to
- 21 have a corresponding requirement to certify that those funds
- 22 have been appropriately used. It's our understanding that
- 23 the organizations who receive money under the member item
- Alemsilves Lave to 24 process do pass the certify through the pass-through agency,
- 25 for example, to the Department of Education in the case of

1 Ms. Huntley and others, that they, the organization, have

- 2 carried out their mandate. But those organizations, as we
- 3 have seen, are often sadly under the thumb of corrupt
- 4 politicians. These certifications can't be relied upon.
- 5 And certainly, if someone is in charge of or has the
- 6 ability, and I would submit, the grave responsibility of
- 7 helping to allocate tax payer money to help citizens, many
- 8 of whom are in grave need of these services, they should be
- 9 prepared to provide information about how that money was
- 10 used.
- 11 But in terms of specifics, I would of course leave it
- 12 to this Commission to look at those issues and come up with
- 13 specific solutions.
- 14 MR. FITZPATRICK: Gerry?
- MR. MOLLEN: US Attorney Lynch, is there any
- 16 provision in federal law, I think this topic has been
- 17 mentioned by both US Attorneys, is there any provision in
- 18 federal law that would require one public official to report
- 19 corrupt misconduct when observed by another public official?
- 20 MS. LYNCH: There is no specific statute that
- 21 imposes the requirement, frankly, on anyone to report
- 22 misconduct. There are certain employment related statutes
- 23 that impose obligations and duties and handling and possibly
- 24 some OSHA or environmental ones, SO I would have to withdraw
- 25 all of that. But certainly there is no requirement that it

41

- 1 be reported by a politician. But certainly I think that we
- 2 have to encourage that it be done. Part of the problem with
- 3 any organizational corruption, particularly systemic
- 4 corruption that has existed over the years, is the people
- 5 who were not involved in it suffer in several ways, as I
- 6 mentioned. They target the same rush, and people view them
- 7 as corrupt when, in fact, many of our leaders are trying to
- 8 do the right thing. But so many don't want to get involved,
- 9 and in many ways, they're simply trying not to get drawn
- 10 into a negative situation or problem. So that's not the
- 11 problem. But I do think there's room for public officials
- 12 who observe these wrongdoings, who hear these conversations
- 13 to step up and provide information.
- 14 MR. FITZPATRICK: Anybody else? Any other
- 15 questions? Madam US Attorney, thank you for the eloquence
- 16 of your words, and thank you for your suggestions, and most
- 17 of all, thank you for answering our President's call and
- 18 coming back to the public service. The citizens of New York
- 19 are very lucky that you said yes.
- 20 MS. LYNCH: Thank you so much for your time
- 21 tonight.
- 22 MR. FITZPATRICK: Our next speaker is the District
- 23 Attorney of Manhattan, our host DA, if you will. DA Cy
- 24 Vance started out his career in the Manhattan DA's office,
- 25 as I think about 90 percent of this Commission did, working

1 for Bob Morgenthau. DA Vance handled all kinds of cases

2 when he was in the office and, sadly for New York, he moved

42

- 3 to Seattle, but luckily he decided to return and he became
- 4 the New York County District Attorney on January the 1st,
- 5 2010. Cy was so impressive to his 61 other elected DA's
- 6 throughout the state that last year we made him president of
- 7 our association, and his service was nothing short of
- 8 outstanding. I could tell you about all the bureaus that
- 9 he's created. A lot of them have to do with white collar
- 10 crime prosecution. He also had the foresight to create a
- 11 blue ribbon panel dealing with issues of white collar crime
- 12 that, naturally, include public corruption.
- 13 Cy is joined by Chief Assistant Dan Alonzo. I have
- 14 known Dan through my association with Cy and through my
- 15 association with the DA's Association. He is nothing short
- 16 of outstanding in his service of the people of New York.
- 17 There isn't a DA in the State of New York, including Cy,
- 18 that doesn't feel he can pick up the phone, talk to Dan and
- 19 get some incredibly sound advice. He's had a distinguished
- 20 career and he's won numerous awards, many of them having to
- 21 do with his professional integrity as an attorney. He's
- 22 also been involved in numerous public corruption
- 23 prosecutions and was very, very instrumental in helping Cy
- 24 draft the white collar crime task force report. So DA Vance
- 25 and Chief ADA Alonzo, we welcome you both, and I will turn

1 it over to you, DA Vance. Thank you very much for being

- 2 here.
- 3 MR. VANCE: Chairman Fitzpatrick, Chairman Rice and
- 4 Chairman Williams, I am honored and I appreciate even being
- 5 asked to speak with Ghief Dan Alonzo, and I also just want
- 6 to thank all of you on the Commission for your service,
- 7 taking the time out from your professional lives and
- 8 personal obligations to do the important work that you are
- 9 doing, and I think all of New York owes you a debt of
- 10 gratitude. As Bill Fitzpatrick said, between July 12 and
- 11 this past year, I served as a one-year term as president for
- 12 the District Attorney's Association for the State, and in
- 13 that capacity, last October I formed the New York State
- 14 White Collar Crime Task Force.
- The task force is co-chaired by District Attorney
- 16 Frank Sedito, who is a Commission member of yours, and my
- 17 Chief Assistant, Dan Alonzo, who is with me today and who
- 18 may be able to assist in answering questions about specifics
- 19 of the task force's recommendations.
- Now, the purpose of this task force was to have a
- 21 thoughtful group of lawyers study our fraud and corruption
- 22 laws from top to bottom, not thinking politics but thinking
- 23 substance, to come up with a set of recommendations that
- 24 could be considered by the legislature in its 2014 session.
- ملات علمی عربی 25 The task force نع not made up exclusively of district

Loadened 4

- 1 attorneys. To the contrary, I brought in the membership to
- 2 make sure it is reflective of views of a number of lawyers
- 3 outside law enforcement, the private practice, the bench and
- 4 academics, and the recommendations of that task force were
- 5 unanimously adopted by the board of directors of the DA's
- 6 Association this past July and we will be publically
- 7 presenting the findings of the task force and releasing its
- 8 full report next week.
- 9 In the meantime, I am pleased to give you a summary
- 10 of our task force's recommendations in the public corruption
- 11 arena, including procedural reforms that we believe are
- 12 absolutely crucial to the effective enforcement of the law.
- 13 Before I turn to several of the task force's specific
- 14 recommendations, I would like to address why we are
- 15 recommending these laws to the state.
- As you just heard from my colleagues, the US
- 17 Attorneys for the Southern and Eastern District %, and as
- 18 everyone in New York government knows well, the FBI and
- 19 federal prosecutors have been remarkably successful in
- 20 policing and prosecuting our public officials. That success
- 21 has led some to suggest that New York does not need criminal
- 22 law reform in the area of political corruption. Some ask
- 23 why do we need to do anything at all when federal
- 24 authorities are doing such a good job. The answer, I
- 25 believe, is pretty straightforward. Reliance on the federal

600al 45

- 1 government to safeguard state and haw integrity, I believe,
- 2 is riski/g public policy, and I also think it's inherently
- 3 intention with the federal system of sovereign states.
- 4 Now to be sure, and let me be clear, in terms of
- 5 public enforcement, the US Attorneys and United States
- 6 Attorney General, to say nothing of the FBI, are clearly and
- 7 actively engaged in rooting out this New York problem. And
- 8 let me also be clear, I have nothing but the greatest
- 9 admiration for my colleagues in the Eastern and Southern
- 10 District / and their incredibly talented staffs, as well as
- 11 the federal law enforcement agencies involved. But there is
- 12 nothing in federal law or politics that requires that they
- 13 continue to be so involved in the future. So why, in a gives primacy
- 14 government that states promising of police power, would New
- 15 York see this area to the federal government of limited
- 16 powers whose future resources and attention may be diverted
- 17 to different priorities.
- Now, we all know that some high level government
- 19 officials and many low level ones do, on occasion, so wind
- 20 up in our state courts. Alan Hevesi, who was described
- 21 earlier, and also Ms. Huntley. But these successes, a
- 22 fraction of our federal counterparts, came about, I believe,
- 23 in spite of the state system, not because of it. Criminal
- 24 prosecution may be not be the answer to all of our society's
- 25 problems, but any system of corruption enforcement is doomed

1 without effective criminal sanctions. It is simply time to

- 2 stop handcuffing state prosecutors and allow them to do the
- 3 jobs that they should be doing to root out political
- 4 corruption.
- And to this end, the task force made seven
- 6 recommendations that most closely relate to the problem
- 7 before this Commission. Two are procedural and five are
- 8 substantive, and I have submitted to the Chairs my written
- 9 testimony, which I hope will be of use to you. But in my
- 10 oral testimony, I will only address three of those seven
- 11 recommendations. Two are procedural and one substantive.
- 12 First, New York should eliminate automatic
- 13 transactional immunity. Federal grand juries may use
- 14 hearsay without limitation, but state grand juries are
- 15 generally required to hear from each person who has personal
- 16 knowledge of the events at issue. And under New York
- 17 current law, which is unique, by the way, in the country and
- 18 not required by any supreme court precedent, every witness
- 19 before a state grand jury automatically receives full
- 20 transactional immunity about anything to do with the matters
- 21 about which they testify, which means that they can never be
- 22 prosecuted in state court for matters about which they
- 23 testify in response to questions. The results, I think,
- 24 have been abysmal for New York in two ways. First, there
- 25 have been numerous miscarriages of justice. In the violent

- 1 crime area, for example, in one case, where a supposed
- 2 witness who had, unbeknownst to the prosecutor, actually
- 3 committed the murder was called before the grand jury and
- 4 thereby absolutely absolved of all liability. In white
- 5 collar crime, an executive whose company had been victimized
- 6 was called before a grand jury to describe the company's
- 7 operations and to testify about a possible extortion.
- 8 Subsequently, a different prosecutor began investigating
- 9 that same executive for tax fraud connected to the company,
- 10 but because the executive had been asked about the company's
- 11 operations by the first prosecutor, the case against him was
- 12 dismissed and the prosecution barred.
- 13 (Now, cases like these, Commission members, have been
- 14 regional over the years, but they pale in comparison to the
- 15 criminal law's second fatal flaw, the chilling effect on
- 16 investigations and prosections of all kinds and,
- 17 particularly, of corruption. Now, prosecutors are
- 18 understandably reluctant to call the very people who know
- 19 about corruption for fear of giving them a pass for all of
- 20 their transgresses as a result of transactional immunity, to
- 21 say nothing about the credibility 🚅 issues that a witness
- 22 must face at trial, having been granted full immunity from
- 23 prosecution. I believe that all 62 of the District
- 24 Attorneys in New York State agree that it would be much more
- 25 sensible for New York to adopt the federal use immunity

- 1 rule, used in the majority of states, which in practice has
- 2 a much less chilling effect on corruption investigations.
- 3 In 1982, state prosecutors, supported by the first
- 4 Governor Cuomo, former Attorney General Robert Abrams, and
- 5 every major editorial board in the state tried and failed to
- 6 get this law changed, and I believe it is time to try again
- 7 and to succeed.
- 8 Second, New York should amend the accomplice
- 9 corroboration requirement. You hear US Attorney Bharara
- 10 talk about what he thought was the biggest obstacle in these
- 11 investigations, and what did he say? It was getting at the
- 12 evidence. The lifeblood of prosecutions of sophisticated
- 13 crime, which corruption typically is, is the use of 17000005 +
- 14 accomplices who are in the best position to supply that
- 15 evidence and information about the inner workings of
- 16 criminal enterprises. But in New York, even when
- 17 co-conspirators switch governments, to use the famous words
- 18 of Sandy Frovano, the US corroboration rule makes it
- 19 impossible to prosecute others without independent
- 20 corroborating evidence.
- Now, this is a sensible concept and one that even I'm
- 22 sure federal prosecutors follow in practice, but its
- 23 interpretation in New York makes it a poison pill in
- 24 corruption investigations. Several prosecutors often
- 25 corroborate the testimony of one corroborator with another.

1 In New York, even nine cooperators corroborating the tenth

49

- 2 is not enough. The evidence must be independent. So how
- 3 about using a tape to prove your case? Maybe, but it had
- 4 better be non-accomplice that vouchers for its authenticity
- 5 or it won't be admissible. These accomplice corroberation
- 6 rules have no place in a system that is serious about
- 7 cleaning up its government.
- 8 Corrupt public officials continue to reap the benefit
- 9 of New York State's outdated and overly restrictive law.
- 10 Although, clearly, accomplice testimony deserves sharper
- 11 scruting at trial, it's not necessarily untrustworthy. With
- 12 proper safeguards and selection from the trial court on the
- 13 inherent dangers on accomplice testimony, such factors, I
- 14 believe, ought to be for the jury to weigh in assessing
- 15 credibility. A cell mate who committed assault and is
- 16 called as a prosecution witness should not be presumed more
- 17 trustworthy, as he is under current law, than a
- 18 self-confessed accomplice to a forgery.
- I recommend, therefore, that New York amend, but not
- 20 eliminate, the accomplice corroboration requirement of CPL
- 21 Section 60.22 to allow cross corroboration by a separate
- 22 accomplice.
- Third, and finally in my testimony before you orally,
- 24 New York should amend its public servant bribery law.
- 25 Although New York State's bribery law, by its terms, is

- 1 violated when a bribe is merely offered or solicited, the
- 2 paradex also requires an elicit, I am quoting, agreement or
- 3 understanding, end quote, in the statute, between the bribe
- 4 giver and the bribery receiver in order for the crime to be
- 5 complete. This exacting element is not required under New
- 6 York's other bribery laws, including public bribery, sports
- 7 bribery and commercial bribery and the less of most other
- 8 jurisdictions, which are subject to the less exacting
- 9 standard and requirement of an intent to influence the
- 10 recipient of the bribe.
- 11 As it stands, therefore, those who bribe public
- 12 officials in New York are less likely to be prosecuted than
- $-4\lambda e\omega$ 13 those who bribe boxers who throw the match. The task
- 14 force's proposal would align New York's public bribery law
- 15 with these other bribery laws. The task force, therefore,
- 16 recommends replacing the agreement or understanding
- 17 requirement in New York's bribery law with a requirement of
- 18 an intent to influence the public servant. This would
- 19 legislatively overrule the Court of Appeals decision of 10
- 20 People V Bactron of 1992.
- 21 I would like to conclude by quoting from the 1987
- 22 article from the New York Times that followed the New York
- 23 City Correction scandals of the mid 1980's. That article
- 24 reported, among other things, that, quote, "half a dozen
- 25 district attorneys said local officials they believe to be

regnich Commissors, any

- 1 corrupt have gone un-prosecuted because New York laws make
- 2 it too difficult, more difficult than in other states, to
- 3 bring corruption cases." That was in 1987, 26 years ago.
- 4 And ladies and gentlemen, things have only gotten worse. So
- 5 thank you for the chance to give my thoughts this evening,
- 6 and Dan Alonze wifl be happy to answer the Commission's
- 7 questions.

8 MR. FITZPATRICK: Thank you, DA Vance. Let me

- 9 start, with the thing that's troubled a lot of us when we
- 10 have been discussing this. The legislator, for a
- 11 hypothetical, who takes a campaign contribution and then
- 12 introduces some obscure piece of legislation, such as tax
- 13 abatement or some other type of thing, that only applies to
- 14 the contributor, absent, you know, a type recording of an
- 15 agreement or an informant or some other type of evidence
- 16 that isn't very likely to appear, is there anything
- 17 prosecutors can do about something like that, other than
- 18 what an average citizen would do, maybe shake their heads → Sa

19 that you can't be serious that this is legal? The tousk Fa

20 MR. ALONZO: First of all, thank you, Bill and Chair

- 21 Fitzpatrick, for having me tonight. I appreciate it. I
- 22 think, like every other corruption case, it turns so
- 23 explicitly on the facts, and under the current law you would
- 24 have to have an agreement or understanding, even under the
- 25 task force's proposal in the case of a campaign

Vance:

- 1 contribution, you would have to have an agreement or
- 2 understanding. Campaign contributions, there's nothing
- 3 special about them, they are benefits under current law so
- 4 they can be a bribe, but you still have to have the
- 5 evidence. So I think just a mere campaign contribution and
- 6 action that benefits a contributor would not be actionable
- 7 under current law.
- 8 MR. FITZPATRICK: Any other commissioners have
- 9 questions for DA Vance or Dan? Nancy? Pofessov
- 10 MS. HOPPOCK: This question is for Dan Alonzo. You
- 11 have been both a state and federal prosecutor, so you're
- 12 aware of the tools available to federal prosecutors and have
- 13 looked at and I know considered the tools available to state
- 14 prosecutors in the penal code. Does your team have the same
- 15 statute, when you contrast it to what the feds have in the
- 16 mail and wire fraud statutes?
- 17 MR. ALONZO: In a word no. I think your question
- 18 is do we have an equivalent to mail and wire fraud, which is
- 19 a key tool that the US Attorneys you have heard from used in
- 20 their prosecutions, not the only tool of course, but the
- 21 value of the mail and wire fraud laws are they are so
- 22 broad and they encompass schemes that can expand several
- 23 years, and they can encompass lots of corrupt behavior, not
- 24 just bribes, but kickbacks, illegal gifts and conversations
- 25 that don't necessarily go anywhere but they're kind of

53

- 1 corrupt, and every sort of vast piece of information,
- 2 without the requirement that you have an independent
- 3 accomplice, being able to call witnesses to the grand jury
- 4 without granting them absolution for everything they have
- 5 done, and all sorts of other tools if you're interested, I
- 6 can talk about that federal prosecutors have that state
- 7 prosecutors don't, or better said, hurtles that we state
- 8 prosecutors face that federal prosecutors do not face.
- 9 So I think New York could use a scheme crime. We
- 10 have proposed, in the task force, an undisclosed self
- 11 dealing law, which deals with course of conduct. That's one
- 12 way to do it. In 2010 DA Vance and then Senator
- 13 Schneiderman proposed a scheme law, similar to federal mail
- 14 and wire fraud. There are a lot of ways to do it. But a
- 15 scheme law, I believe, would be crucial to combatting public
- 16 corruption in New York.
- 17 MR. FITZFATRICK: Thank you, Nancy. Anyone else?
- 18 Anyone? Any questions? Cy, first of all, I have to
- 19 compliment you on the very, very diplomatic way that you
- 20 told Preet and Loretta that we want a piece of the action
- 21 too, but most importantly, thank you for your leadership on
- 22 this issue. You are relatively new as the elected
- ohman, 23 prosecutor, but man, you hit the ground running, and this is
- 24 incredible. And just like all DAs, I hope myself included,
- 25 you surround yourself with great people like Danny. So

1 thank you both very, very much.

- 2 MR. VANCE: Thank you.
- 3 MR. ALONZO: Thank you.
- 4 MR. FITZPATRICK: I appreciate it.
- 5 MS. CALCATERRA: I would like to invite up
- 6 Councilman Eric Ulrich.
- 7 MR. ULRICH: Good evening, Chairpersons Rice,
- 8 Fitzpatrick and Williams, and distinguished members of the
- 9 Moreland Commission to Investigate Public Corruption. My
- 10 name is Eric Ulrich. I am a member of the New York City
- 11 Council, representing the 32nd Council District in Queens
- 12 County. I was elected in a nonpartisan special election in
- 13 2009 and was reelected in a November general election of
- 14 that same year. I was also the republican candidate for New
- 15 York State Senate in District 15 in 2012. And someone who
- 16 has run for both public and party office at the state and
- 17 local level, I greatly appreciate the opportunity to share
- 18 with you my thoughts on the inherent corruption and the
- 19 appearance of such corruption and political campaigns and
- 20 elections in the State of New York.
- 21 We all know that over the past several years New
- 22 Yorkers have had to endure some of the worst public
- 23 corruption scandals in recent memory. These accounts,
- 24 widely reported in almost every media outlet, have caused
- 25 irreparable harm to what former Mayor Ed Koch once called